SHRI YOGINDER K. ALAGH: Because it is a very important issue, Mr. Chairman, Sir.....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: It was set up is 1951 and he is quoting something from 1961.....*(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Alagh is there. He is quite capable. Why are you all standing? Mr. Alagh, you put your question.....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI YOGINDER K. ALAGH: The Minister should read out the original Resolution of the Planning Commission. This is some file note. Uou should have told the Cabinet Secretariat that that note is wrong.....*(Interruptions)* You cannot quote the secret files. You read out Resolution.

SHRI RAM NAIK: I am obliged for his advice. But I read out from the Rules of Business.....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI YOGINDER K. ALAGH: You read out the Resolution adopted by the Planning Commission and if you don't do to.....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now we shall move on to the next question.

Testing of Nuclear Bomb and Missile by Pakistan

*123. SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to a news-item which appeared in the Times of India (New Delhi), dated 17th April, 1998, under the caption "Pakistan ready to test nuclear bomb, 1998, under the caption "Pakistan ready to test nuclear bomb 2000-km-range, Ghaznavi missile in the offing too: Abdul Qadeer";

(b) whether Government have taken/propose to take the matter with UN; if so, when; and

(c) the measures Government propose to take to strengthen country's defence?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI VASUNDHRA RAJE): (a) Yes, Sir.

(b) No Sir.

(c) Government closely monitors all development relating to research, development and acquisition of armaments by Pakistan. Government remains fully committed to taking all necessary steps to effectively safeguard India's security and national interests in accordance with its own threat perceptions.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, 11th, 13th and 28th of May go in the annals of history of the sub-continent as bad days of the sub-continent. It is unfortunate that by thoutless.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You put your question.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: I am formulating the question... *(Interruptions)* I am not a new Member. I have been in Parliament for very long. I know how to put questions... *(Interruptions)*

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: जनतंत्र में विश्वास करते है.....(व्यवधान).... सदन के अंदर भी आप क्या दूसरों को नहीं बोलने देंगे?.....(व्यवधान)

†श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: जनतंत्र में विश्वास करते हैं...."मदाखलत"...सदन के अंदर भी आप क्या दूसरों को बोलने नहीं देंगे..."मदाखलत"...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now you put your question...*(Interruptions)*

श्री राजनाथ सिंह "सूर्य": ऐसे ही खड़े हो जाते है.....(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Sir, by thoughtless and reckless testing of nuclear weapons,...

†[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script

MR. CHAIRMAN: You put the question, please.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: With your permission, Sir, I am putting this question. By these tests, India and Pakistan have landed themselves into a nuclear arms race. In fact, Sir, as Mr. Prime Minister just now said,—he goes on changing policies—India had and has got a well-established nuclear policy based on national consensus. The national consensus and policy was to keep the nuclear option open. The choice before the country was to exercise its option... *(Interruptions)*

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Sir, is it a question? We have already had three debates in the House on this subject...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: But, unfortunately, as we have got a weak Government, in order to divert the attention of the people...*(Interruptions)*

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is not a question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please put a question...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Sir, why are they teaching me procedures? *(Interruptions)* I am formulating my question. You are having a new set of rules for me.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no, you please put your question.

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: You cannot put this type of a question.

SHRI SANJAY NIRUPAM: Sir, I have a point of order. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him finish putting the question. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: In Question Hour, no point of order can be raised. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: *

SHRI MD. SALIM: *

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU:*
SHRI MD. SALIM:*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: At one point of time they say there will be a moratorium on tests but at another time they say there will be a review of the stand. May I ask the hon. Prime Minister, in the context of the statement made by the Secretary of State in USA whether the Government has formulated a final stand on this policy and whether they are going to sign the CTBT or NPT. What is the stand taken by the Government of India? I would like to know whether they are going to have a national consensus on this before giving a final say.

SHRIMATI VASUNDHRA RAJE: Mr. Poojary is a long-standing Member of this House. The question relates to a particular article in a newspaper. The question he has raised has nothing to do with this. So I am afraid I will not be able to reply to this. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: My question was very clear.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now put a second supplementary.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: This is not my second supplementary. My first question is not answered.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please put your question. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Sir, I am requesting you Sir, protect us, and tell us whether the question is relevant or not an whether it is not connected with the supplementary.

MR. CHAIRMAN: My dear Sir, I am asking you to put a supplementary.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Sir, I have asked a pointed question. I would like to know whether they are

*Not recorded

going to have a final stand on the signing of CTBT or NPT. It is a pointed question and the Prime Minister is here. He can give an answer.

SHRIMATI VASUNDHRA RAJE: Sir, I will just read out the question. The question is whether...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Only you have to decide it. You cannot rule out the supplementary which does not arise out of the question. But the Minister cannot decide whether the question is relevant or irrelevant. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VASUNDHRA RAJE: Sir, I can explain the question to you. The question says very clearly, it has to do with an article in a newspaper, the clipping of which I have, and of that he has asked whether Pakistan is ready to test a nuclear bomb—'Ghaznavi missile in the offing too', by Mr. Abdul Kadir—and whether the Government has taken or proposes to take the matter up with the U.N. to which I have said 'no' and we propose to take to strengthen the country's defence to which I have replied. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: What about the supplementary? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: The Minister cannot decide whether the supplementary is relevant or irrelevant. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: Only the Chair can decide. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. *(Interruptions)* Please.

SHRI TRILOKI NATH CHATURVEDI: The Minister has given the reply to your question. You forget the question and start asking about CTBT....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, you have to give the direction.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Give us a ruling, Sir. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI TRILOKI NATH CHATURVEDI: She has already replied. Your supplementary was... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: The supplementary is connected directly with my question. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I speak? This question was asked on the basis of a report in a newspaper of 17th April. Since 17th April much water has flowed into the Ganges. So, this question doesn't remain relevant. What the hon. Member is asking now is about the current situation. Technically the Minister is correct that this doesn't arise out of it. But...

AN HON. MEMBER: Politically!

MR. CHAIRMAN: Not political, because I didn't want to stop the hon. Member since on the issues which he is raising, the Prime Minister has already replied. So, the Minister's reply is correct as far as it goes technically. Because of the national interest involved, I allowed the hon. Member to ask this question and I think the Prime Minister will very well reply whether the Government is going to sign the CTBT or not.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: सभापति महोदय, आपने बहुत सोच-विचार करने के बाद निर्णय लिया, मैं उसके लिए आपका आभारी हूं। यह उत्तर पहले प्रश्न के लिए दिया गया था, तब से परिस्थिति बदलती है और स्वाभाविक है कि माननीय सदस्य नई परिस्थिति के बारे में सवाल पूछें। हमें उनका उत्तर देने में कोई कठिनाई नहीं है। हम किसी प्रश्न का उत्तर टालना नहीं चाहते। इस सवाल पर यह कहा गया कि अभी तक राष्ट्रीय सहमति रही है और वह राष्ट्रीय सहमति मैं समझता हूं कि अभी भी है और आगे भी रहना चाहिए। एन०पी०टी० को हमने स्वीकार नहीं किया, सी०टी०बी०टी० के बारे में हमने आपत्ति की। हमने कहा कि यह भेदभाव-पूर्ण संधियां हैं और इन संधियों को उनके वर्तमान स्वरूप में स्वीकार नहीं किया जा सकता। लेकिन, जबसे हमने विस्फोट किया है, अणु-परीक्षण किया है, विस्फोट नहीं, तब से हमारे ऊपर दबाव बढ़ रहा है, भारत से कहा जा रहा है, हमारे पड़ौसी देश से भी कहा जा रहा है कि आप इन संधियों पर दस्तखत करिए, बिना शर्त के दस्तखत करिए। हमने इसे स्वीकार नहीं किया है। हमने कहा है कि हम

सी०टी०बी०टी० के बारे में आपके साथ चर्चा करने को तैयार है, लेकिन सी०टी०बी०टी० को उसके वर्तमान स्वरूप में अभी स्वीकार करने का कोई सवाल नहीं है।

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: What about my second question, Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. Enough is enough now. I have given the ruling. Please sit down.

SHRI JANARDHANA POOJARY: What is the ruling?

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have asked two questions. Please sit down now.

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Sir, my question is a very short and simple one. Where is this missile race leading us to? Should we not try to defuse this situation? Pakistan is building a missile with a 2,000 kilometre range; we will build one. Then, Pakistan will build another with a 2,500 kilometre range; we will build another. But, what about the missiles which are already there? With whatever missiles that are already there, both India and Pakistan can be destroyed many times more. It may not hit Calcutta; but this will destroy the rest of the country. I would like to know from the Prime Minister whether he is trying to have some dialogue with Pakistan and try to ensure that the arms race, this mad arms race is stopped.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: सभापति महोदय, भारत पाकिस्तान के साथ वार्ता के लिए तैयार है, पहले भी तैयार था। कुछ प्रस्ताव पाकिस्तान के सामने ढाका की बैठक में रखे गए थे, जिनमें यह सुझाव था कि हम दोनों देश मिलकर समस्याओं को हल करें और उन समस्याओं में शांति और सुरक्षा की समस्या भी हो और अगर पाकिस्तान कश्मीर के सवाल को उठाना चाहता है तो कश्मीर के सवाल पर भी चर्चा करने के लिए हम तैयार हैं, लेकिन पाकिस्तान की तरफ से इस बारे में अभी तक कोई सकारात्मक उत्तर नहीं मिला है। हम आशा करते हैं कि उत्तर मिलेगा, दोनों देश आपस में बैठकर समस्याओं का समाधान निकालेंगे। हमें साथ-साथ रहना है, हमें एक दूसरे की मदद के लिए तैयार रहना चाहिए। भारत किसी हथियारों की दौड़ में नहीं है। हमारा अणु परीक्षण किसी देश के खिलाफ नहीं है। हम अणु परीक्षण करके उन देशों से कहना चाहते थे जिन्होंने अणु हथियारों के अम्बार लगा रखे हैं और जो उन हथियारों के अम्बार को कम करने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं और सारी दुनिया को उपदेश देते घूमते हैं कि शांति बड़ी चीज़ है। भारत को शांति का पाठ कौन पढ़ा सकता है? लेकिन यह बात कही जा रही है। इसलिए हम पाकिस्तान के साथ द्विपक्षीय वार्ता के लिए तैयार हैं। कल भी ईरान के विदेश मंत्री आए थे, उनसे बहुत अच्छी बात हुई। उनको भी यही स्पष्ट किया गया और हमने कहा कि जहां तक न्यूक्लिअर, परमाणु प्रश्न का सवाल है, यह केवल भारत और पाकिस्तान के बीच का मामला नहीं है, इसमें और भी देश हैं और न्यूयार्क में या कहीं भी एक सम्मेलन का अयोजन किया जा सकता है जो न्यूक्लिअर डिसआर्मामेंट के बारे में गंभीरता से प्रयास करे, यह प्रयास नहीं हो रहा है। हमें और पाकिस्तान को कहा जा रहा है। सारी दुनिया का प्रयास हो, हम भी उसमें शामिल होने के लिए तैयार हैं, हम अपना योगदान देने के लिए तैयार हैं। हमारे यहां शांति है। कल भी मैंने कहा, मैं फिर उसको दोहराना चाहता हूं कि कहां तनाव है, किसके बीच में तनाव है? हमने परमाणु परीक्षण किया, पाकिस्तान ने अपना परमाणु परीक्षण किया, तनाव तो नहीं होना चाहिए। फ्रांस ने परमाणु परीक्षण किया, चीन परमाणु परीक्षण कर चुका है, उनके परमाणु परीक्षण करने से तनाव पैदा नहीं होता और केवल हमारे परमाणु परीक्षण करने से तनाव पैदा होता है, यह कैसी बात है। कोई तनाव नहीं है, शांति है और हम वार्ता के लिए तैयार हैं, द्विपक्षीय वार्ता के लिए तैयार हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO STARRED QUESTIONS

Compensation to kin of Haj Pilgrims died in stampede

*124. SHRI AMAR SINGH: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to the news-item appearing in the Hindustan Times, dated 10th April, 1998 under the caption "150 Haj Pilgrims died in stampede";

(b) if so, what is the number of Indians who died in the stampede; and